Citizen-Driven Government Performance

Professor Marc Holzer
Rutgers, The State University of New Jersey, Campus at Newark
May 2004
Comprehensive Public Sector Productivity Improvement

- Managing for Quality
- Developing Human Resources
- Adapting Technologies
- Building Partnerships
- Measuring for Performance

Resource Inputs (Money, Labor, Energy, etc) → Internal Capacities → Outputs (Services) → Outcomes (Impacts)

Subjective/Personal → Objective/Empirical → Legislative / Chief Executive / Corporate / Media / Citizen Judgments

Feedback Re: Budget-Management Decisions
Management for Quality

• Managing for Quality
  – Top Management
  – Customer Focus
  – Long-Term Strategic Planning
  – Employee Training and Recognition
  – Employee Empowerment and Teamwork
  – Measurement and Analysis
  – Quality Assurance
Human Resource Management

- Developing Human Resources
  - Recruiting the Best and Brightest
  - Providing Systematic Training
  - Recognizing Diversity
  - Building Services by Building Teams
  - Providing Employee Assistance
  - Balancing Employee and Organization Needs
Adapting Technology

- Providing Open Access to Data
- Automation for Enhanced Productivity
- Delivering on the Public’s Demands
- Cost-Effective Applications
- Cross-Cutting Techniques
Building Partnerships

- Community Partnerships: Citizens & Volunteers
- Public Sector Partners
- Private Sector Partners
- Not-for-Profit Partners
Measurement for Performance

- Measuring Performance & Evaluation
  - Establishing Goals & Measuring Results
  - Estimating & Justifying Resource Requirements
  - Reallocating Resources
  - Developing Organization Improvement Strategies
  - Motivating Employees to Improve Performance
Comprehensive Improvement

- Integrated Approach
  - Management for Quality
  - Development of Human Resources
  - Adapting Technologies
  - Promoting Partnerships
  - Performance Measurement & Evaluation
Comprehensive Public Sector Productivity Improvement

Managing for Quality
- Top Management Support
- Customer Focus
- Long-Term Strategic Planning
- Employee Training and Recognition
- Employee Empowerment and Teamwork
- Measurement and Analysis
- Quality Assurance

Developing Human Resources
- Recruiting the Best and Brightest
- Providing Systematic Training
- Recognizing Diversity
- Building Services by Building Teams
- Providing Employee Assistance
- Balancing Employee and Organizational Needs

Adapting Technologies
- Providing Open Access to Data
- Automation for Enhanced Productivity
- Delivering on the Public's Demands
- Cost-Effective Applications
- Cross-Cutting Techniques

Building Partnerships
- Community Partnerships—Citizens and Volunteers
- Public Sector Partners
- Private Sector Partners
- Not-for-Profit Partners

Measuring for Performance
- Establishing Goals and Measuring Results
- Estimating and Justifying Resource Requirements
- Reallocating Resources
- Developing Organization Improvements Strategies
- Motivating Employees to Improve Performance

Resource Inputs (Money, Labor, Energy, etc.)

Internal Capacities
- Outputs (Services)
- Outcomes (Impacts)

Subjective/Personal

Objective/Empirical

Feedback Re: Budget-Management Decisions

Legislative/Chief Executive/Corporate/Media/Citizen Judgments
Citizen-Driven Government Performance

Innovative measurement and improvement approaches based upon the citizen-driven government performance experience.
For several years the *Alfred P. Sloan Foundation's* "Performance Assessment of Municipal Governments Program" has been encouraging the creation and widespread adoption of measures of municipal government performance that objectively measure outcomes that matter to people.

The Program's approach emphasizes citizen involvement to ensure that what is measured is what matters to citizens and that the data are not corrupted by the natural desire of officeholders to report favorable outcomes.

Website: [http://www.andromeda.rutgers.edu/~ncpp/curriculum/](http://www.andromeda.rutgers.edu/~ncpp/curriculum/)
Citizen-Driven Government Performance

The Program's strategy

1. Demonstration projects in selected municipalities.

2. Other projects that promote the adoption of citizen-based performance.
   - Citizens are involved in these projects in many ways. In particular, some are encouraging the creation of interactive websites that will enable direct citizen participation in performance assessment.

Website: http://www.andromeda.rutgers.edu/~ncpp/curriculum/
Citizen-Driven Government Performance

• Sloan-related projects are curricular resources for use in such programs as:
  - Master of Public Administration
  - Master of Business Administration
  - Master of Public Policy
  - Master of Social Work
  - Certified Public Manager Program

• These case experiences offer important learning opportunities and are available at no charge through the National Center for Public Productivity.

Website: http://www.andromeda.rutgers.edu/~ncpp/curriculum/
Citizen-Driven Government Performance

Offerings:

- Curricular Resources for Faculty
- Online Certificate in Performance Measurement
  - Public Performance Measurement: *Citizen-Driven Government Improvement*
Citizen-Driven Government Performance

The purpose of the "Citizen-Driven Performance Measurement Curricular Project" is to facilitate the classroom use of a unique set of case studies on performance assessment and citizen involvement.

For several years the Alfred P. Sloan Foundation’s "Performance Assessment of Municipal Governments Program" has been encouraging the creation and widespread adoption of measures of municipal government performance that objectively measure outcomes that matter to people. The Program's approach emphasizes citizen involvement to ensure that what is measured is what matters to citizens and that the data are not corrupted by the natural desire of officeholders to report favorable outcomes. The Program's strategy has two parts: (1) demonstration projects in selected municipalities; and (2) other projects that promote the adoption of citizen-based performance. Citizens are involved in these projects in many ways. In particular, some are encouraging the creation of interactive websites that will enable direct citizen participation in performance assessment.

This website features Sloan-related projects as curricular resources for use in such programs as the Master of Public Administration, Master of Business Administration, Master of Public Policy, Master of Social Work, Certified Public Manager Program, etc. We feel that these case experiences offer important learning opportunities.

To learn more about the Citizen-Driven Performance Measurement Curricular Project, view our recently published booklet that includes a summary of all the case studies highlighted on this website. (Link to PDF)

For Curricular Resources: Registered Users (click here) Not Registered (click here)
Key Areas:

– Performance, Trust and Citizen Engagement
– Performance, Evaluation and Budgeting
– Managerial Behavior and Decision Making
– Management Skills and Techniques
– E-Governance and Accountability
Democratic accountability is the touchstone of democracy and the ultimate goal of many administrative reforms.

This module explores the importance, ideas, and procedures of citizen driven performance measurement. Students will come to see the value, in terms of improving democratic accountability, of involving citizens in the measurement of state and local government performance. Through theoretical and practical exercises, students will systematically examine the important dimensions of citizen involvement in performance measurement:

- Will performance measurement without citizens’ input necessarily improve public organizations’ democratic accountability?
- Why should citizens be included in performance measurement for government organizations?
- How can citizens play a role in the measurement of government performance? To what extent?
Citizens’ trust in government is important to a democracy. However, the past several decades have witnessed a declining trend in trust in many industrial countries.

This module explores the relationship between trust in government and citizen driven performance measurement. Students will come to see the value, in terms of improving citizens’ trust in government, of involving citizens in the measurement of state and local government performance. Through theoretical and practical exercises students will systematically examine the important dimensions of trust in government as it relates to citizen driven performance measurement:

- Will better government performance lead to higher levels of trust in government? What are the governmental areas where citizens have the lowest confidence? How can we develop performance indicators for those areas that are meaningful to citizens?
- Will more participation lead to higher trust in government? How can we develop appropriate participation techniques to foster and sustain citizen involvement in performance measurement?
- What are other possible ways of improving trust in government?
The belief that individuals should be given a voice in their governance appeals to our democratic ideals and in fact, has long been identified internationally as one of the unique aspects of the United States.

The main questions students will examine in the module are:

- Why is citizen engagement important? What are the benefits of citizen engagement in government procedures?
- What are possible techniques for citizen engagement? What are the goals of citizen involvement programs?
- What are common mistakes in citizen engagement programs? How can we handle them?
Performance measurement is an important tool in identifying and measuring quality of life indicators; especially when citizens are involved in developing and reporting these measures.

This module explores the relationship between performance measurement and citizen participation.  

- How can we develop indicators of performance that are meaningful to citizens and public administrators?  
- How do we effectively communicate these measures to the public so that citizens can hold government accountable for results?  
- How can we develop appropriate participation techniques to foster and sustain citizen involvement in performance measurement?  
- How do citizens know they are getting value for their tax dollars?
The focus of this module is to stress performance measurement and citizen participation as they relate to public budgeting.

How can we:

- Apply budgeting knowledge and skills in actual cases of state and local budgeting?
- Learn and demonstrate various factors that contribute to and influence public service provision and citizen-driven performance measurement?
- Learn and demonstrate the various approaches to citizen participation and performance measurement?
203: Program Evaluation and Program Improvement

How can we:

- Conduct program evaluation and policy analysis to determine organizational effectiveness?
- Find ways to include citizens in setting program and policy priorities?
- Present evaluation and policy analysis reports to a diverse audience?
- Discuss how the results of evaluation and policy analysis are used at different levels of government and in different institutional settings?
How can we:

- Discuss the importance of strategic management methods and tools in government and identify opportunities to include citizens in the planning process?

- Foster collaboration between government and citizens when developing organizational goals?

- Design the process for disseminating and utilizing strategic plan objectives among government and citizens?
Beyond the democratic mechanism of open, competitive elections is the notion that government decisions, and hence performance, can be greatly improved by incorporating the direct input of citizens.

- How can we foster citizen participation in managerial decision making in government?
- Will citizen participation improve managerial decisions in the public sector?
- Can we develop performance indicators to ensure that managerial decisions in government reflect the interests of the citizenry?
- Does citizen participation, through its impact on managerial decisions, improve the services delivered to the citizenry?
Managers at the local levels must continually search for new resources to expand tight operating budgets in order to meet the immediate and long-term needs of their communities.

One proven approach to meeting these challenges is involving the citizens of the community in government affairs.

- How can we foster greater community participation in local government affairs?
- Will citizen participation and community empowerment improve public managers’ abilities to meet the challenges of their communities?
- Can we develop performance indicators to ensure that public managers are relying on the voices of the citizens in their communities?
- How does participation by a community’s residents impact public managers, and does it improve the delivery of services?
Recently, citizen satisfaction surveys have become increasingly more common as many jurisdictions attempt to gauge citizen expectations and satisfaction with government services. Nevertheless, many public officials still fear citizen surveys.

- Are citizen surveys necessary? Wouldn’t public officials know citizens’ preferences and levels of satisfaction anyway? Do citizens really know their preferences?
- What is a survey process? How should it be designed? How can we reach the right citizen? How can we ask questions? What are good questions and what are not? How can we increase response rates?
- How should we deal with the data collected through surveys? How can we generate knowledge from data? How can we interpret the results?
- How do we use survey results to improve services? How should public officials convey the survey results to citizens?
402: Interpreting and Presenting Data

The importance of research in helping us understand the impact and influence of public policy, citizen behavior and performance measurement on program viability and productivity.

How can we:

- Clearly report data to citizens?
- Use simple graphics in addition to spreadsheets and tables?
- Emphasize trends in achieving promised goals?
403: Information Technology and Public Administration

Technical, political, social, and economic aspects of new and old technologies and the issues they pose for governance and other areas of public administration.

How can we:

- Develop a basic understanding of what are information technologies and information systems, and their relationships to each other?
- Increase knowledge about the basic framework of a planning an information system project?
- Develop a broader perspective on the issues and requirements in implementing an information systems project?
Governmental transparency allows individuals to gain a better understanding of what is going on inside of government.

- Will stronger governmental transparency policies improve democratic accountability at all levels of government?
- Why should individuals care about freedom of information and open meeting policies?
- How can individuals gain better access to government?
The role of e-government and e-governance in today’s society and in public organizations has emerged in the past decade and such practices are still evolving.

- What government services are currently offered using technology as a medium?
- How can citizens be empowered by using technology?
- What are the limitations and dangers of using technology for government interactions?
What is the role of e-government and e-governance in today’s society and in public organizations, with an emphasis on the effective management of information and its flow?

What are useful skills in information management, information technology, computer-mediated communications, and the improvement of managerial systems dedicated to effective information flow within organizations?

How can we identify structure, and solve information-based problems in organizations?

How can we understand some of the limitations and dangers involved with the rapidly changing role of information and information technology in today's society?
## Certificate On-line Modules:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Performance, Trust and Citizen Engagement</th>
<th>Performance, Evaluation and Budgeting</th>
<th>Managerial Behavior and Decision Making</th>
<th>Management Skills and Techniques</th>
<th>E-Governance and Accountability</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
• Certificate Design
  The Certificate design allows managers to complete the requirements in a time frame most relevant to their work: during working hours, after work, or on weekends.

• Certificate Requirements:
  – 12 one-credit modules
    (five required and seven elective)
  – Modules are five weeks in length
Citizen-Driven Government Performance
Montclair, New Jersey

The project began with the convening of numerous, informal meetings with citizens, citizen groups, elected officials and municipal managers to develop an understanding of two critical aspects of the township:

- How do citizens, municipal managers and elected officials communicate and interact with each other?
- How do citizens, municipal managers and elected officials determine the Township of Montclair is doing a good job providing services?
Citizen-Driven Government Performance
Montclair, New Jersey
Dayton, Ohio has a long established system of citizen participation through seven Priority Boards. The Dayton project’s objectives are to facilitate the selection of Quality of Life Indicators by seven Priority Boards, ensure the initial production of the indicators and institutionalize their annual publication within the City of Dayton Planning Department.
Priority Board
Residents Satisfied with Dayton Parks.

The figure shows the percent of survey respondents saying they were “satisfied” or “very satisfied” with Dayton parks in 2001.

88% satisfied
12% dissatisfied
In 2001, the Alfred P. Sloan Foundation funded a three-year project called “Citizen-Initiated Performance Assessment” (CIPA) in Iowa, which engages citizens, city council members and departmental staff to develop and use performance measures to evaluate public services.
Citizen-Initiated Performance Assessment
Iowa

How did we serve you?

Please fill this out to help us maintain quality services. *All responses remain anonymous.*

**Reasons for /Occasions of my recent interaction with a Police office:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Your gender:</th>
<th>Male</th>
<th>Female</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Age:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>under 19</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19-25</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26-40</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>41-55</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>56-65</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>above 65</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Please rate the following:**

- Staff’s professional appearance
- Staff’s professional conduct and courtesy
- Staff’s competency in handling an emergency situation
- Response time of arrival at scene after a 911 call
- Citizens’ awareness of the Neighborhood Watch program
- My understanding about how to be involved in Neighborhood Watch
- My trust in the department to keep my community safe
- 911 Call center
- Prompt response in handling your call
- Dispatcher’s knowledge and competency
- Dispatcher’s courtesy and professionalism
- My trust in the Call Center to help me in emergency situations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Excellent</th>
<th>Acceptable</th>
<th>Poor</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

**Resource of Directories**

- City Administration
  - Administration: 223-6220
  - Emergency: 911
- Community Development
  - Administration: 223-6221
- Fire Department
  - Administration: 223-1595
  - Emergency: 911
- Library
  - General Inquiry: 453-2221
- Parks and Recreation
  - Administration: 223-5246
- Police Department
  - Administration: 278-1312
  - Emergency: 911
- Public Works
  - Administration: 223-6231
- Water & Sewer
  - Administration: 223-6220

**Comments:**
The Straphangers’ Campaign represents a bold attempt to influence the accountability, accessibility and performance of local government on behalf of its citizens.
Straphanger’s Campaign
Transit in New York City

**Straphangers Campaign**

**1/9 SUBWAY LINE PROFILE**

The 1 & 9 line ranks 6th out of the 20 subway lines rated by the Straphangers Campaign. Our ranking is based on the MTA New York City Transit data below, using a method described at www.straphangers.org.

**On cleanliness, the 1 & 9 performs both above and below the system average...**

- **% of cars with "light or no interior dirtiness"**
  - **(as defined by NYC Transit)**
  - **Summer '02**
    - 1 & 9 line: 87%
    - System Average: 79%
  - **Fall '02**
    - 1 & 9 line: 70%
    - System Average: 76%

**You're more likely to get a seat on the 1 & 9.**

- **% seated at most crowded point during rush hour**
  - 1 & 9 line: 42%
  - System Average: 41%
In 1998, the Fund for the City of New York's Center on Municipal Government Performance released results of an unprecedented research project that uses state-of-the-art laser technology and citizen input to produce the first reliable, objective ratings of the smoothness of New York City's streets.

Test engineers drove a car equipped with profilometers that counted and measured every dip and rise encountered from potholes, bumps, misaligned utility covers, uneven repairs and more.

The extensive data collected were then analyzed to produce two indicators that New York City residents identified as meaningful to them:
- Smoothness Score
- Jolt Score.
Street Smoothness Project
The Fund for the City of New York

Measuring Street Smoothness in New York City
The City Scan Project, which puts state of the art technology in the hands of citizens, is considered a national model for citizen-based assessment of the performance of city government.

City Scan empowers citizens to set community priorities and hold city government accountable for performance. The project's ultimate goal is to encourage citizens to behave as customers and owners of the government programs that shape their community.
Partnerships Key to Achieving Results
Worcester, Massachusetts

In 1999, the Worcester, Massachusetts, Municipal Research Bureau received a three-year planning grant from the Alfred P. Sloan Foundation to:

- Connect government goals to community results
- Produce a comprehensive municipal data inventory
- Utilize benchmarking data to help the City achieve its goals
Insideschools.org, an online guide to New York City public schools sponsored by Advocates for Children of New York, was created with a grant from the Alfred P. Sloan Foundation to help parents assess the performance of their schools. The site allows parents to find a school, learn about their legal rights, ask for advice or send complaints directly to a school. In its “find a school” section, Inside schools offers profiles of 1,200 schools.
Inside Schools – Advocates for Children
New York City

[Image of a high school search tool on Insideschools.org]
Online Module Home Page

Citizen-Driven Performance Measurement: An Introduction
Instructor: Marc Holzer, Kathryn Hammond

Welcome to Citizen-Driven Performance Measurement: An Introduction

This course marks an exciting opportunity to explore the importance, idea, and procedures of citizen-driven performance measurement. This online course is offered through the e-College platform. E-College facilitates learning via the Internet and provides a wealth of technical support through the Student Orientation Tutorial (located under “Special Courses”).
Student Feedback

“I am firmly convinced of the need for more citizen involvement in the whole issue of governance and intend to pursue that interest in both research and in active application… seeing your offering here online sparked a good deal of interest in me…”

http://www.andromeda.rutgers.edu/~ncpp/